

**The Occupation of Palestinian Art:
Maps, Land, Destruction and Concealment**

Garrett Bailey
A New Middle East?: Diagrams, Diagnosis and Power
June 2016

Abstract

Violence in the Middle East has been the focal point in news media. My paper has shifted the focus to forms of non-violent resistance as it pertains to Israel-Palestine. Palestinians have used art as a means of resistance before Israel declared itself a state in 1948. By focusing on Palestinian artists, I am able to show the ways in which art can reveal and counter Israeli Zionists rhetoric. Artists tear down the fallacies of Zionist propaganda through non-violent means. Resistance art is expressed in different forms, from maps, architecture and sculpture to film and graffiti. By examining Palestinian artists' work throughout the history of the Israeli-Palestine conflict, I am able to find out more about Israel's settlement building, border technology, pro-Israel lobbies, the tactics of the Israel Defense Force, and the censorship of Palestinian art.

Palestinians have engaged in non-violent resistance from the beginning of Israel's military occupation. Through an examination of maps, architecture, graffiti and film, I explore Israel's military tactics and their mechanisms of control. How does art shape the perceptions and realities of Israel/Palestine? Palestinian art is a necessary tool in exposing the oppression of the Israeli government and countering Zionist rhetoric.

Zionism's purpose in the early 20th century was to find a homeland for the Jewish people living in the diaspora, proving the fall of the Ottoman Empire after World War One disastrous for the Palestinians. The land of the Ottoman Empire became topic of various negotiations among nations, with some negotiations more authoritative than others. Britain's Lieutenant Colonel Henry McMahon, in a series of letters in correspondence with Bedouin Leader Sharif Hussein, promised land which included Palestine to the Arab people.¹ These letters proved to be empty promises after the Balfour Declaration and the Sykes-Picot agreement all but handed the land of Palestine to the Zionists.

The Zionist narrative in securing land for the eventual state of Israel were tactics increasingly described today as ethnic cleansing, while in March 1948 David Ben-Gurion and the Zionists officially called it Plan D. The creation of Israel has been a war on two fronts, one in the actual obtainment of land, and the other the continual insistence that Palestine is the rightful land of the Jewish people. When Israel's oppression, illegal occupation and ethnic cleansing is called into question, the standard Zionist narrative is to call any and all criticisms of Israel antisemitic. This defense mechanism is one of many which makes the concealment of the Israeli government policy of oppression continue undeterred. One of the major factors to counter Zionist rhetoric

¹ Friedman, Isaiah. "The McMahon-Hussein Correspondence and the Question of Palestine." *Journal of Contemporary History* 5, no. 2 (1970): 83-122. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/259746>.

and the injustices perpetrated by the Israeli government is Palestinian produced art. How does an artist make aware the injustices of a regime? What role does art play in resistance movements?

In order to advertise Palestine, posters were created by Zionist organizations. A poster was created and circulated with two prominent words: 'Visit Palestine'. The poster accentuated the beauty of the land with an olive tree in the foreground and the Dome of The Rock in the distance. Franz Kraus designed the 'Visit Palestine' poster in 1936, one of many in an anthology of posters advertising Palestine to Jewish people. According to the Zionists, Palestine was the only place for Jews to escape the diaspora. Theodore Herzl proclaimed Palestine as the “land without a people.” Palestine as an idyllic empty land fits perfectly into the overall Zionist narrative with the production of posters a mechanism of influence as it:

was necessary to visualize and then to implement a scheme for creating a network of realities- a language, a grid of colonies, a series of organizations – for converting Palestine from its present state of “neglect” into a Jewish state.²

The posters were intended for a specific purpose, intentionally created, produced and displayed to entice Jewish people to permanently move to Palestine. The Jewish National Fund's intent was to have these posters displayed everywhere:

We must inundate the Jewish people with slogans and pictures, to rivet their attention, to create an atmosphere of unrest...[to distribute the pictures and slogans] in every place a Jew sets foot in: in communal centres, lodges, places of business, society and union centres, the offices of charity organizations, mutual aid societies, rabbinical offices, libraries, theatres, bath houses and rest houses, shelters, hospitals, pharmacies, clinics, synagogues, seminaries, schools, doctor's waiting rooms, restaurants, hotels, pensions... leave no place where there is no illustrated poster with a clear and brief text.³

Franz Kraus was born in Austria and moved to Israel later in life. These posters were a

² Said, Edward W. 1992. *The question of Palestine*. New York: Vintage Books, p. 86

³ "The Palestine Poster Project Archives." Blessed Land of Israel Awaits Redemption.
<http://www.palestineposterproject.org/poster/blessed-land-of-israel-awaits-redemption>.

way for Kraus to express and support Zionism. In developing these posters, Kraus created an idyllic image of Palestine, one that Jews can make pristine and beautiful. Palestinians were not included in Kraus' posters, as this was a way to propagate the ideal environment of a people-free Palestine before the arrival of immigrating Jews. Kraus designed dozens of these types of posters for the Jewish National Fund, each with varying degrees of Zionist demagoguery and iconography. The titles of the posters alone tell a narrative with “Redeem The Land,” “Invest in Palestine: Build The Jewish State,” and “Blessed Land of Israel Awaits Redemption.”

Palestinian produced art is a way to counter the narrative of the Zionist propaganda posters, by which the production and creation of art by Palestinians is in and of itself a tool to put into action empowerment of the Palestinian people. At times, the artists' work is already complete in the case of the 'Visit Palestine' poster which are sold in the West Bank and Gaza. Palestinians have embraced the poster because “sixty years later, 'Visit Palestine' has been appropriated by indigenous Palestinians who actively distribute reprints throughout that landscape to demonstrate the emptiness of Zionism’s myths.”⁴

The 'Visit Palestine' poster is infamous for encapsulating the Zionist goal in a single image. However, the production of pro-Zionist posters was not purely a Franz Kraus venture. Many other Zionist funded posters showcased an idealized Jewish paradise for potential migrants. *And We Will Set Down Roots Here* is a Jewish National Fund poster from 1950 of Jewish children in Palestine farming. The message for these type of Zionist posters was of afforestation and reclamation. The Zionist ideology that Palestine belonged to the Jews and Jews needed to come back to the land to reclaim it by farming the land. Each poster is meticulously

⁴ Walsh, Daniel J. 2011. *The Palestine Poster Project Archives: Origins, Evolution, And Potential*. Georgetown University. [p. 84]

constructed with the purpose to symbolize Zionist ideology because:

the land belongs to those who work it. It is the saplings' potential to rejuvenate the soil thereby bringing it back to life that explains the tree's value as a symbol for Zionism. The subtext of this poster states that as these saplings grow into the soil so will the children who planted them grow into a new identity, one inseparable from the land. Moreover, just as the land is returning to its rightful state of fertility and productivity, so the Jewish people by the act of afforestation, will blossom into their authentic identities as workers of the land.⁵

While the Zionists were creating posters to advertise to potential Jewish migrants as a tool to propagate the ways in which Zionism “reclaimed, redeemed, repeated, replanted, realized Palestine, and Jewish hegemony over it.”⁶ Palestinians also created art to counter the narrative of the Zionist propaganda posters, in an attempt to have their own voice and to be seen, as Edward Said says:

Thus, if the Arab occupies space enough for attention, it is as a negative value. He is seen as the disrupter of Israel's and the West's existence, or in another view of the same thing, as a surmountable obstacle to Israel's creation in 1948. Insofar as this Arab has any history, it is part of the history given him (or taken from him: the difference is slight) by the Orientalist tradition, and later, the Zionist tradition. Palestine was seen- by Larmartine and the early Zionists- as an empty desert waiting to burst into bloom; such inhabitants as it had were supposed to be inconsequential nomads possessing no real claim on the land and therefore no cultural or national reality.⁷

While the Jewish National Fund created Zionist propaganda posters and Israel exiled hundreds of Palestinians from their homes, Palestinian artists reflected and expressed the exile through art. In 1953 Ismail Shammout painted *Whereto*, an image of a lost homeland, a father and sons wandering, directionless. The painting is a direct response to the Nakba, an exiled person traversing to nowhere. *Whereto* represents “*al-ghurbah*, the Arabic term that means both

⁵ "The Palestine Poster Project Archives." And We Will set Down Roots Here.
<http://www.palestineposterproject.org/poster/and-we-will-set-down-roots-here>

⁶ Said, Edward W. 1992. *The question of Palestine*. New York: Vintage Books. [p. 87]

⁷ Said, Edward W. 1978. *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon Books. [p. 286]

'diaspora' and the estrangement of being separated from the familiar home.'"⁸ *Whereto* is symbolic of Shammout's own life as well. Shammout was a refugee in Gaza for two years before being able to attend the College of Fine Arts in Cairo. Returning to Gaza in 1953, Shammout was the first ever Palestinian to hold an art exhibition on Palestinian land.

Due to looting and the confiscation of Palestinian property, countless pieces of art have been lost to history. During the ethnic cleansing of Haifa the endgame was not solely to get rid of hundreds of thousands of Palestinians, but everything else they owned:

On the morning of 16 May 1948 Jewish forces took complete control of the Arab suburb of Baqa'a....During this time looting of Arab houses started on a fantastic scale, accompanied by wholesale vindictive destruction of property...valuables and personable effects were taken....we saw horse-drawn carts as well as pick-ups laden with pianos, refrigerators, radios, paintings, ornaments and furniture, some wrapped in valuable Persian carpets..The loot was transported for private use of for sale in West Jerusalem.⁹

The lack of Palestinian art during this time lends people to believe Palestinians do not engage in or produce art, which is clearly not true. Art has been present in Palestinian culture just as with any other culture. It is a matter of tracking paintings and other art which was lost during this time, with a few cases of art living on only through photographs. One such piece of art is a photo by Ali Zaarur of a painting of the Madonna, mounted on a wall. Just above the painting is a hole in the ceiling from a bombing, creating a halo effect above the image. The photograph reveals a larger story. The photograph of the painting is more important than the actual painting because without the mortar shelled hole above the painting, this would probably have never been captured in a photo. What is captured is the wholesale attempts at erasure of Palestinian culture and life. The ethnic cleansing of Palestine in 1948 was much more than the removal of

⁸ Ankori, Gannit. 2006. *Palestinian art*. London: Reaktion. [p. 49-50]

⁹ Ibid.[p. 26]

Palestinians. It was to make sure their entire existence in Palestine appear to have never occurred, making the transition to the state Israel become a reality.

Since Israel did not exist as a state before 1948, the plan to ethnically cleanse Palestinians out of their homes was in full effect, where “nationalism is not the awakening of nations to self-consciousness: it *invents* nations where they do not exist.”¹⁰ Israel, the Jewish National Fund and Franz Kraus were constructing an image of a nation using art and posters to conceptualize a land only for Jews. It was a struggle between constructing a new nation versus the fight to retain one, “thus-1948 became the defining date not only as the Nakba but also the birth of a heightened sense of national identity and the deliberate construction of a National Art Movement.”¹¹

The art movement has not strictly been Palestinians creating art as a way to voice displeasure with the Israeli occupation of Palestine. Israeli artists have also added a critical voice to the conversation. As the Israeli government pretends that Palestine was never a land full of people, Israeli artist Larry Abramson painted the ruins of a Palestinian village, Suba. The oil paintings produced by Abramson:

calls attention to the specific blinding mechanisms that inform the Israeli Zionist visual field, in which the land (of Israel) is imagined as an empty (abstract) space: a tabula rasa on which Jewish history can be created anew.¹²

The hundreds of thousands of Palestinians forced out of their homes in 1948 had very limited options as their next place to live. They became refugees in their own country, with some Palestinians confined to Gaza and some to the West Bank. With the constant barrage of Zionist

¹⁰ Anderson, Benedict R. O’G. 1991. *Imagined communities: reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. London: Verso. [p. 49]

¹¹ Ankori, Gannit. 2006. *Palestinian art*. London: Reaktion. [p. 21]

¹² Hochberg, Gil Z. 2015. *Visual occupations: violence and visibility in a conflict zone*. Duke University Press [p. 52]

posters publicizing Palestine as the land for Zionist Jews, Palestinians continue to confront this rhetoric. If the Israeli government are under the impression Palestinians will one day change their mind and simply leave Palestine altogether, they are wrong.

Here We Shall Stay is a 1980 poster by Abed Abdi.¹³ The poster epitomizes the struggle of Palestinians, with this particular image of a man wearing a kaffiyah, a raised fist clutching the barbed wire which confines the village. In the background, a woman stands in front of children with the title of the poster written in Arabic above, "Here We Shall Stay." The poster reflects the determination of Palestinians to one day be free, to return to the land they are now forbidden. Posters such as *Here We Shall Stay* is a direct response to the Zionist posters which makes clear that the expulsion of 750,000 Palestinians is unacceptable, challenging the silence of the international community, because ethnic cleansing is the "ideological infrastructure on which the Jewish state was built,"¹⁴ while at the same time Israel expects Palestinians to "accept that their oppression and expulsion"¹⁵ in 1948 is justified.

Palestinian art after the Nakba was a reflection and reaction to the ethnic cleansing by Israel. Palestinian artists continued this trend with a poster for the newly created *Palestinian Liberation Organization*. In 1965, Ismail Shammout created a logo for the PLO, a Palestinian flag above a map of Palestine, ushering in a new era in Palestinian resistance art. Flags are highly visible elements which are able to be flown, posted and displayed. The ability by the Israeli government to ban these flags can limit the visibility of Palestinian resistance. However, some forms of Palestinian resistance occur underground. Whereas flags can be confiscated,

¹³ "The Palestine Poster Project Archives." *Here We Shall Stay*. <http://www.palestineposterproject.org/poster/here-we-shall-stay>

¹⁴ Chomsky, Noam, Ilan Pappé, and Frank Barat. 2015. *On Palestine*. Haymarket Books. [p. 27]

¹⁵ Ibid.[p. 53]

underground tunnels have to be destroyed, creating a highly visible destruction of resistance meant to remain hidden.

The West Bank, Gaza and the Golan Heights are the occupied territories of Israel, wherein which the inhabitants mode of movement is highly constricted. Palestinians are not permitted on Israeli roads, with passage through Israeli checkpoints a mandatory requirement in traversing Palestinian land. This is the case due to Palestinian land being intentionally cordoned off and quarantined from one another, existing in pockets of space with Israeli settlements as the divider. These borders were not drawn on a map nor agreed upon by parties on equal footing. The boundaries change when Israel begins developing settlements on Palestinian land. A map of the region from 1946-2000 shows the dissolution of Palestinian land, with Palestine compressed and compacted into a smaller area of land as the years progress.¹⁶

Israel is able to shift and adjust the borders, operating between an occupying force and intermittent invader while at the same time acting as innocent bystanders to Palestinian aggression. However, Israel's presence in the occupied territories invokes another layer of control, as “the mere existence of the military bases within close proximity to Palestinian villages and towns helped create the impression that the inhabitants were constantly being observed.” Israel exerted this power and control through a “panoptical tower” where the “use [of] military bases, settlements, and bypass roads” were used “in order to strengthen Israel's control over the population.”¹⁷

The surveillance and visibility/invisibility of Israel's presence in the occupied territories make the importation of goods and services into Gaza a rigid process. Everything from potato

¹⁶ “Palestinian Loss of Land.” <http://cdn.timesofisrael.com/blogs/uploads/2015/02/map.jpg>

¹⁷ Gordon, Neve. 2008. *Israel's Occupation*. 1st ed. University of California Press. [p. 42]

chips, size A4 paper and cattle are banned from entering Gaza.¹⁸ The answer to the strict control of supplies into Gaza made tunnels an unforeseen consequence of Israel's "infrastructure of control," where Israel's General Secret Services "was given the task of undermining all Palestinian insurgency" where the "permit regime and surveillance apparatuses served as the basic mechanisms by and through which the inhabitants were managed."¹⁹ Hamas constructed underground tunnels leading from Gaza to Egypt, with "an average of \$30 million/year in 2005 to \$36 million/month"²⁰ during Operation Cast Lead from 2008-2009. Although the tunnels may not be a perfect system, it helps the economy of Gaza from completely crashing.

Israel purports these tunnels to be "terror tunnels," ignoring and displacing their own illegal activities such as the building of settlements on Palestinian land. Palestinians have been forced to break in and out of their own land as if they were prisoners. Palestinians are made to escape their living space, enter another country and break back into the small portion of land they are allotted. The situation makes it so that all of Gaza's residents conduct illegal activities simply through living there. If Israel is the controller and dictator of the land, then Palestinians in Gaza are the subverters, the forced-upon burglars of their own space. Palestinians are using the land how they want, literally carving it to once again serve a purpose beneficial to Palestinians, by Palestinians. It is a tunnel system built out of necessity, as a Hamas leader explains, "No electricity, no water, no food came from outside. That's why we had to build the tunnels."²¹ The tunnels are needed to counter Israel's intention of keeping the "Gazan economy functioning at the lowest level possible."²²

¹⁸ "Partial List of Items Prohibited/Permitted into the Gaza Strip." May 2010. Gisha. <http://gisha.org/UserFiles/File/HiddenMessages/ItemsGazaStrip060510.pdf>

¹⁹ Gordon, Neve. 2008. *Israel's Occupation*. 1st ed. University of California Press. [p. 24]

²⁰ Nicolas Pelham. 2012. *Gaza's Tunnel Phenomenon: The Unintended Dynamics of Israel's Siege*. Journal Of Palestinian Studies. Vol 41. [p. 10]

²¹ Ibid. [p. 9] (pelham)

²² "Submit Documents to WikiLeaks." Cable: 08TELAIVIV2447_a. https://wikileaks.org/plusd/cables/08TELAIVIV2447_a

Calling the tunnels “terror tunnels” is simply another way to dehumanize an entire population, perpetuating the fallacy that the driving force and motivation for these tunnels is to harm Israeli citizens. The insistence by Israel of terrorism where there is none makes it so that the tunnels are perceived to be an inherent construction of evil when history says otherwise as Israel has:

aimed to manage the population by producing a certain kind of security, in the past decade it has controlled the population by producing insecurity. This insecurity has no doubt benefited Hamas, not only because of its ability to fill in the institutional vacuum, but also because of its ideological conviction.²³

The Israeli occupation provides the insecurity in which the avenue for the resistance of the occupation is fostered. Weapons are transported through these tunnels at the same time billions of dollars from the United States are wire transferred to fund Israel's military; F-16's, missile defense systems such as Iron Dome (to intercept Qassam rockets), tanks, howitzers, bombs and ammunition. Hamas plays a catch-up game of which they can not win against the powerful Israeli military, where Hamas's “worldview and actions are shaped both by its opposition to modernity and colonialism as well by its incorporation of certain elements integral to modernity.”²⁴

The tunnels underneath Gaza function as a path to the outside world. The landscape of Israel-Palestine has belonged to the Israelis while the tunnels are one of the few things Palestinians are able to control. It is the underground landscapes, one that does not show up on maps. It is a subversion of the rules and regulations, breaking the borders in the most invisible way possible. This while Israel bulldozes Palestinian homes as punishment²⁵, as an exertion of

AVIV2447_a.html.

²³ Gordon, Neve. 2008. *Israel's Occupation*. 1st ed. University of California Press. [p. 221]

²⁴ Ibid. [p. 221]

²⁵ Mulder, Emily. "House Demolitions: Israel's 'court-sanctioned Revenge'" - Al Jazeera English. October 14, 2015. <http://www.aljazeera.com/news/2015/10/house-demolitions-israel-court-sanctioned-revenge-151014072814209.html>.

power. Israel will say the home demolitions is to deter terrorism, however, the evidence points to home demolitions as a tool of expansion and to clear land for new settlements.

Israel can shape the visible land and architecture, restructure it to fit their purpose where "the army has even developed 3-D models of Gaza and the West Bank, down to the locations of internal doors and windows,"²⁶ while it is ineffective at controlling and preventing the things they do not see, the absence of tunnels from an aerial satellite image, built and dug out underneath the surveillance of the Israeli government. The tunnels are the subversion of Israel's control tactics, conducting "illegal" activities in the blind spots of the *panopticon*. In the case of publicly available blueprints and floorplans of businesses and homes, the:

publicly accessible reproductions of those plans would deliberately omit certain key details for reasons of security. The drawings would leave out entire staircases, for example, or even every family bedroom, so that intruders could not use these documents to plot burglary.²⁷

The West Bank and Gaza's architecture is used against Palestinians with the use of 3D topographical maps. The tunnels are the altered floor plans, the intentionally deceptive blueprints of the landscape of Palestine. If Israel is thought of as the burglars of Palestinian space and are the intruders to Gaza, Palestinians simply cannot only alter the floor plan to "hide the architecture," they must also alter the architecture to conceal and disrupt Israel's knowledge of the structures.

In 2014, Israel's 'Operation Protective Edge' dropped bombs to destroy the tunnels, leaving homes demolished and hundreds of thousands of Gazan residents homeless. The tunnels are being destroyed only to be rebuilt later, but this may not go on for much longer. Israel is developing an "Underground Iron Dome— a system that could detect and destroy cross-border

²⁶ Manaugh, Geoff. *A Burglar's Guide to The City*. 2016. 1st ed. New York. Farrar, Straus & Giroux [pg 224]

²⁷ Ibid. [pg 225]

tunnels.” The system involves seismic sensors to detect underground vibrations. Based off the readings from the sensors, Israel would then be able to map the tunnels in order to launch missiles to destroy them. The Underground Iron Dome is a weaponized version of border security, with the United States as a mutual partner in developing systems to control and monitor borders. Elbit Systems, and Israeli company, provides services to both, and is traded on NASDAQ and the Tel-Aviv stock exchange. Both Israel and the U.S. employ Unmanned Ariel Systems (such as the M.A.L.E. Hermes 900)²⁸, thermal imaging to detect body heat, and Unattended Ground Sensors²⁹. Contracts going to companies providing these services such as Elbit Systems and Northrop Grumman are in the hundreds of millions of dollars, making the oppression of Palestinians a lucrative endeavor.

Elbit Systems of America is a subsidiary of the Israel branch providing border security in Nogales, Arizona³⁰. The link between Nogales and Gaza and Elbit systems are the tunnels, where the same company can use land across the globe as a testing area for the border technology systems to use in Gaza. In the United States the Border Enforcement Security Task Force shuts down and destroys tunnels using the same CAT bulldozers which demolish Palestinian homes,³¹ and the same CAT bulldozers which kill U.S. citizens in defense of those homes.

The United States is betting on the Underground Iron Dome being the solution to tunnels in Gaza, as they are providing \$120 million dollars for Israel “to establish anti-tunnel capabilities

²⁸ “Elbit.” Elbit. <https://www.elbitsystems.com/elbitmain/area-in2.asp?parent=3&num=31&num2=31>

²⁹ Collaborative Point Paper On Border Surveillance Technology. Dec 2007. NATIBO. <http://www.acq.osd.mil-/mibp/natibo/BorderSurveillance.pdf>

³⁰ "Border Agency Ready to Expand Virtual Fence along Southern Border." Nextgov. <http://www.nextgov.com/defense/2016/03/border-agency-ready-expand-virtual-fence-along-southern-border/126873/?oref=ng-relatedstorie>

³¹ Clark, Jonathan. "Digging in to Destroy a Tunnel." Nogales International. June 3, 2014. http://www.nogalesinternational.com/news/digging-in-to-destroy-a-tunnel/image_a94320d4-eb34-11e3-8d8d-0019bb2963f4.html

to detect, map, and neutralize underground tunnels that threaten the U.S. or Israel.”³² With multiple tunnel collapses killing several people trapped inside after the end of Operation Protective Edge, Hamas has suspicions the Underground Iron Dome is already active.

If this is the case, Israel will have the means to completely cut-off an already decimated Gaza, all in the name of 'counter-terrorism,' when evidence points to a blatant and intentional suppression of the Gaza Strip. The Underground Iron Dome is another layer of surveillance by Israel to stop the *terrorists*, when it is in effect the newest way to monitor, track, categorize and manage Palestinians. Since there is a question of the Underground Iron Dome's current operating status, more power is given to Israel's surveillance. This keeps Palestinians highly visible to the Israeli government and highly invisible to Israeli citizens “to further conceal the act of erasure itself,” where the “majority of Israeli's remain blind not only to the existence of Palestinians,” but also “to the blinding mechanism that renders them invisible to begin with.”³³

The “separation fence” is an example of the blinding mechanism, as the walls are placed strategically closer to Palestinians homes and villages and further away from Israeli settlements, relegated to the underground. The effect is Palestinians being encapsulated, while the Israeli settlements' view is not obstructed by the wall. The architectural framework in which these walls are constructed serve a simultaneous use, as concealment of and from Palestinians and the physical border between Israelis and Palestinians.

Maps have been around for centuries, developed by nations to delineate land, borders, trade routes, rivers, oceans and people. Such was the case with the Sykes-Picot agreement, which was accompanied with a map to mark out which section of land would be under British or

³² Schwartz, Yarden. "Israel Is Building a Secret Tunnel-Destroying Weapon." *Foreign Policy*. March 10, 16. <http://foreignpolicy.com/2016/03/10/israel-is-building-a-secret-tunnel-destroying-weapon-hamas-us-gaza/>

³³ Hochberg, Gil Z. 2015. *Visual occupations: violence and visibility in a conflict zone*. Duke University Press [p. 21]

French control. Now maps are accessed online, with the advent of Google Earth providing an unprecedented view of the world where users can select an array of options to navigate the world thanks to satellite imagery and aerial photography. Along with Google Street View, users can see for themselves how the world looks. However, Google Earth provides current maps and information, as it is not exactly a tool to see how nations and countries were developed.

For Israel, a nation without declared borders, a map of the region will differ from how Palestinians view the land, as not all maps are created equal, where the “vast majority of maps in Palestinian and Israeli schoolbooks omit the existence of the other entity”³⁴ Although a distinction does have to be made, as Israel wields the power and authority to control borders, whereas Palestinians can only attempt to hold on to and remember the land which is taken away. Israeli school textbooks omit the existence of Palestine while the constructions of Jewish settlements in the West Bank make this a reality. Israel's political agenda cannot be ignored, as maps are the “expression and fulfillment of power,” and “a map always manages the reality it tries to show.”³⁵ During the Oslo Accords, twenty thousand apartments were built in the West Bank, along with bypass roads connecting the settlements to each other and to Israel. In addition, the population of Jewish settlers increased from “a hundred and ten thousand in 1993 to a hundred and ninety-five thousand in 2000.”³⁶ By building these Jewish settlements in the West Bank, Israel's maps in school textbooks will be accurate, as the physical features of the landscape will catch up to the absence of Palestine on their maps.

The Israeli government has a history of concealing Palestinian land, providing an alternate history to the ruins left behind after 1948. With Google Earth, Jenin resident Thameen

³⁴ Sherwood, Harriet. "Israeli and Palestinian Textbooks Omit Borders." The Guardian. February 04, 2013 <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/feb/04/israeli-palestinian-textbooks-borders>

³⁵ Hunt, Tristram. 2013. “Israel, Palestine and the mapping of Power.” The Guardian. February 04, 2013 <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2013/feb/04/israel-palestine-power-maps-ptolemy>

³⁶ Gordon, Neve. 2008. *Israel's Occupation*. 1st ed. University of California Press. [p.193]

Darby created a layer to reveal the towns and villages lost in 1948, where eight-hundred thousand Palestinians became refugees. To access Darby's layer, a link is provided in Google's product forums to download a file, which opens with any map application.³⁷ The file provides a list and visual plot points for each city lost or destroyed with a detailed categorization system.

Darby's additional layer to Google Earth:

tactically deploy[s] the map to expose colonial violence as the root of the conflict. Thus, Nakba maps can be better understood not as the art of agency but as the art of resistance, for these are maps specifically produced to help dismantle a colonial status quo.³⁸

Darby's Nakba layer is a vital tool to counter Israeli Zionist rhetoric, as it challenges the Israeli settlement building in the West Bank and provides the necessary history Israel tries so hard to obscure. For instance, the 1948 Nakba, the Israeli government offered “sorrow for the suffering of the refugees,” as they would for “any accident or natural disaster,”³⁹ as though ethnic cleansing is an act of nature, and not at the direction of a brutal regime.

There are few traces of Palestinian life once they are forced out of their homes by military planning authorities. The traces of Palestinian existence is either paved or planted over to make room for Jewish settlers, invariably creating neighborhoods for generations to come, without a second thought to the previous inhabitants of the land. The Jewish settlements become ubiquitous, as though an expropriation order issued by Israeli authorities never happened. As Edward Said states:

In the history of colonial invasion, maps are always first drawn by the victors, since maps are always instruments of conquest; once projected, they are then implemented. Geography is therefore the art of war but can also be the art of resistance if there is a counter-map and a counter strategy.⁴⁰

³⁷ Darby, Thameen. “Nakba- The Palestinian Catastrophe.” Google. February 12, 2006.

https://productforums.google.com/forum/#!topic/gec-history-illustrated-moderated/-_QaklbTcnQ

³⁸ Quiquívix, Linda. 2014. "Art of War, Art of Resistance: Palestinian Counter-Cartography on Google Earth." *Annals Of The Association Of American Geographers*. 104, no. 3: 444-459. [p.447]

³⁹ Gregory, Derek. 2004. *The colonial present: Afghanistan, Palestine, and Iraq*. Blackwell Pub. [p. 102]

⁴⁰ Edward W. Said, *The Politics of Dispossession; The Struggle for Palestinian Self-Determination 1969-1994*.

In Israel's case, those maps have been drawn up since the first Zionists stepped foot in Palestine as the “imaginative geographies” are “performances of space.”⁴¹

Google Earth uses satellite imagery to compile data, using high-resolution photographs in order for the software to be a viable tool for millions of users, however, the Kyl-Bingaman Amendment included by the United States Congress limits “satellite imagery of Israel, the West Bank, and Gaza Strip at 2 meters per pixel,”⁴² while the standard satellite images for the rest of Google Earth are 10 to 20 meters per pixel. Israel hopes this limited resolution will conceal building of illegal settlements in the West Bank. The Israel lobby has such a large presence in the United States, they are able to control how it is viewed online. Yet, Darby's layers “expose Israel’s founding violence,” and “throws into crisis Israel’s presentation of itself as peaceful.”⁴³ The added layer includes information for the villages destroyed in the Nakba, highlighting areas where ethnic cleansing occurred with parts of the map marked as “Destroyed/Ethnically Cleansed Towns,” and “Under Israeli military occupation since 1967.”

In addition to the Nakba layer on Google Earth, a website called Visualizing Palestine creates interactive maps and other graphics to showcase the problems of Israel-Palestine. In a map titled *Shrinking Palestine*, the team at Visualizing Palestine shows how much land Palestinians have lost to the Israeli's from the year 1918-2015. With the color blue representing Palestine and black for Israel, the map starts off almost completely blue. The next date on the map is 1947, when under British Mandate, land was sold to Zionist organizations. The map started to turn from blue to black up to 1960, with the most of the map turning black after the

⁴¹ Gregory, Derek. 2004. *The colonial present: Afghanistan, Palestine, and Iraq*. Blackwell Pub. [18-19]

⁴² Quiquívix, Linda. 2014. "Art of War, Art of Resistance: Palestinian Counter-Cartography on Google Earth." *Annals Of The Association Of American Geographers*. 104, no. 3: 444-459. [p.448-9]

⁴³ Ibid.[p.453]

Nakba of 1948. If the cartography of maps is a process of a political agenda, with each country or nation being the center piece in their own world map, Visualizing Palestine is able to show Israel as the dominant landholder just at Israel deletes Palestine out of its maps in school textbooks. Although Visualizing Palestine informs of the correct history and violence of the Zionists while Israeli textbooks maintains “The Arabs denied the right of the Jews to settle in the Land of Israel,” because the Arabs “completely ignore the historic connection of the Jews with the Land of Israel.”⁴⁴ This ignorance of the “colonial situation in Palestine” was a driving force in developing Visualizing Palestine as Co-founder Ramzi Jaber says:

I saw an opportunity to tackle a false narrative that is prevalent not only in the west but also included ignorance that exists among diaspora Palestinians and Arabs. Storytelling is a venerated Arab tradition and we wanted to augment it through harnessing the power of technology and design to create visual stories that reached a wide number of people.⁴⁵

It is with infographics such as *Segregated Roads*, a map of Israel-Palestine, where co-founders Ramzi Jaber and Joumana Al Jabri team of artists and researchers can visually display which roads are either accessible or inaccessible to Palestinians, while highlighting the checkpoints and other restrictions of travel placed on Palestinians living in the West Bank. Since statistics are always part of any world conflict, where people become numbers in a sea of endless statistical data, Joumana Al Jabri expresses that:

Visualizing data is a tool to make things tangible. The latest example of how data and numbers have been used to further de-humanize a tragedy is in the media coverage of the war in Syria. Numbers are repeated and regurgitated incomprehensibly, increasing the distance between the general public and events on the ground. When numbers don’t mean anything, the sense of urgency is lost.⁴⁶

Israel's power is charted, graphed and categorized, with Visualizing Palestine offering a

⁴⁴ Sherwood, Harriet. "Israeli and Palestinian Textbooks Omit Borders." The Guardian. February 04, 2013 <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/feb/04/israeli-palestinian-textbooks-borders>

⁴⁵ Hamdan, Sadiqua. "Social Justice Pioneers through Technology: An Interview with Ramzi Jaber - Current Affairs." Current Affairs. January 6, 13. <http://www.kalimatmagazine.com/currentaffairs/13705458>.

⁴⁶ Miltenburg, Anne. "Fighting with Visuals for Social Justice - What Design Can Do." What Design Can Do. May 26, 2014. <http://www.whatdesigncando.com/blog/2014/05/26/fighting-with-visuals-for-social-justice/>.

perspective Israel would rather not be revealed. Where if Israel is added to the list of colonizers and settlers who “destroyed the local population by various means,” such as “genocide,” Israel's goals “to re-create themselves as the owners of the country and reinvent themselves as the native population,”⁴⁷ is further torn down. Israel's settlement building is a continuation of ethnically cleansing the West Bank, as:

It was clear that building civilian Israeli settlements was a political statement comparable to the Knesset decision in June 1967 to annex East Jerusalem: the settlements were built in places from which Israel had no intention of withdrawing.⁴⁸

Israeli citizens are able to form groups (Gush Emunim) and choose which piece of the West Bank to build settlements in. The Israeli government does not put up a real fight, subsidizing the settlements which are built near Nablus and converting Israeli military installations into settlements. The establishment of these type of settlements “followed a pattern that had been established in Kfar Etzion and the Park Hotel in Hebron,” where the members of Gush Emunim and the Israeli government shared “messianic and militaristic ideologies” where the land was considered “national and cultural property.”⁴⁹

With map making and counter-cartography as predominant factors in Israel-Palestine, artists have taken it upon themselves to shed light on this as well. While the Israel government 3D maps Palestinian towns such as Nablus in the West Bank, artist Mona Hatoum made a map of Palestine called *Present Tense* using cubes of Nablus soap. Glass beads were used as borders and pushed into the soap. This particular type of soap is hand made in Palestine, with the production being the same for centuries. The soap is a symbol of resistance as a response to maps from the Oslo Agreements, where artist Mona Hatoum :

⁴⁷ Chomsky, Noam, Ilan Pappé, and Frank Barat. 2015. *On Palestine*. Haymarket Books. [p. 17-18]

⁴⁸ Gordon, Neve. 2008. *Israel's Occupation*. 1st ed. University of California Press. [p. 125]

⁴⁹ Ibid [p.124]

came across a map divided into a lot of little areas circled in red, like little islands with no continuity or connection between them. It was a map showing the territorial divisions arrived at under the Oslo Agreements, and it represented the first phase of returning land to the Palestinian authorities. But really it was a map about dividing and controlling the area...I decided that I would like to do something with this local soap made from pure olive oil.⁵⁰

The olive oil from the olive trees, as the symbol of Palestinian attachment to the land. The Israeli government has uprooted millions of olive trees, destroying the the land at the same time it destroys the symbol. The soap was an intentional choice for the artist, as the cubes were placed on the ground where the olive oil based soap would eventually melt back to the ground. Hatoum's *Present Tense*, the map of a soon to be melted away map of Palestine “express[es] a concept of the mutability of man made borders and the transient nature of existence.”⁵¹

Hatoum's map of Palestine shows the “conflict between stability and instability,” the map is not the traditional map of Palestine. *Present Tense* was created in 1996, and melted away before the Oslo “peace process” melted away soon after. Four years later the instability represented in *Present Tense* became reality when the second intifada began after Israel's Ariel Sharon visited the Temple Mount.

Mona Hatoum as cartographer, showing that even before the second intifada the fragility of the lines drawn on the Oslo maps. *Present Tense* was created and assembled with the symbols and iconography of Palestine in mind, with this exhibition as resistance. Where the resistance was made to eventually melt away, although when the soap melts it is not entirely gone. The red glass beads are still there, the soap expands and spreads, making Mona Hatoum's art as the resistance.

The non-violence of Palestinian resistance has been one of the most under reported

⁵⁰ Ankori, Gannit. 2006. *Palestinian art*. London: Reaktion.[p. 152]

⁵¹ Ibid.

aspects to the Israeli-Palestine conflict. When people think of the Israel-Palestine conflict, it is not an image which lacks an element of violence. The image which comes to mind is the Israel Defense Force dropping bombs and Palestinian suicide bombers. However, there has always been an aspect of non-violent resistance to the Israeli government, although non-violent movements is not 'breaking news' for news media outlets.

A problem for a non-violent resistance movement in Palestine is competing with Hamas and their military wings. Hamas' beginnings have marked them as a terrorist organization, making illegitimate every action thereafter. During the first intifada Hamas:

mobilised its members and supporters through the network of mosques and universities. It demanded the abolition of the State of Israel and advocated armed struggle against Israeli occupation. Hamas's insistence that all historical Palestine was an Islamic waqf⁵² led to civil rights campaigns to recover confiscated Muslim waqf property in Israel..⁵³

Hamas was created out of response to Israel's oppression, growing stronger in the 1990's as a resistance movement, during a time when Israel conducted "mass deportations" and expelled "Palestinian academics, doctors, engineers, clergy, teachers...where many of them were killed by the Israelis." Israeli's actions bolstered the case for Hamas as the dominant resistance movement in the region, leading:

to stronger resistance against Israel and insistence on the right of return, as the large-scale deportation was a reminder of the 1948 and 1967 displacements. Gradually, Hamas developed a closer relationship with Hezbollah and consequently with Iran.⁵⁴

The dilemma for Palestinian resistance is the non-recognition of peaceful protests and non-violent resistance. The use of violence against Israel happens when non-violent resistance is either ignored or met with violence. In the case of Hamas being viewed as a terrorist

⁵² Waqf: an Islamic endowment of property to be held in trust and used for a charitable or religious purpose.

⁵³ Bateman, Milford, and Rostami-Povey, Elaheh. *Iran's Influence: A Religious-Political State and Society in Its Region*. London, GBR: Zed Books, 2010. ProQuest ebrary. Web. 6 May 2016. [p. 160]

⁵⁴ Ibid. [p. 160]

organization, they:

are likely to start using nonviolent tactics when the regime allows for an open political discourse, when the public supports peaceful negotiations over terrorist violence, or when forming a political party with the intent to govern a defined area is already part of the organization's goal.⁵⁵

When non-violent resistance is perceived to be ineffective, resorting to violence will seem like the next logical choice. Violence can and has certainly worked in certain instances throughout history. The major factors which makes violent resistance succeed is having a military or militia comparable to the other side. If ones side's military is under-funded, or in the case of Palestinians, nonexistent, the chances of winning becomes dismal. The options for resistance become limited, the tactics of the resistance become violent and the non-violent resistance is overshadowed. The tactics of an underfunded military and guerrilla warfare are similar. Monetary constraints will effect how wars are fought. Rocket and mortar attacks, suicide bombings, vehicle born explosive devices are employed because they are cheap and fairly easy to carry out. These are not tactics exclusive to terrorists, and every act of violence by Hamas is not "terrorist violence." If this were the case, Israel would have to be considered a terrorist organization. It is important to note that a non-violent resistance is not always in conjunction with a violent resistance movement. In every conflict between Israel and Palestine the death tolls are extremely disparate, however the way in which deaths and violence is reported and categorized are the factors in public perception. Israel responds to inaccurate Qassam rockets with a disproportionate barrage of artillery fire.

Violence in the Middle East has not been thought of as *regular* violence. Violence perpetrated by an Arab/Muslim is always thought of as terrorist violence. Their violence is the

⁵⁵ Lickteig, Jennifer. *Terrorist Organizations and the Use of Non-violent Tactics*. Northwestern Journal of International Affairs. Fall 2009. Vol. X, Issue I.

“bad” type of violence as they are already seen as inherently violent people. At the same time this “bad” violence takes place, Israel and the United States are able to drop bombs and conduct drone strikes with civilian deaths being “inadvertent” or “collateral damage.” The mode of violence matters in as much as whom the violence is carried out by. Violence in and of itself cannot be condemned, as violence can be justified or excused. Sanctions against Iraq in the 1990's which lead to the deaths of five-hundred thousand Iraqi children is “worth it”⁵⁶ to punish Saddam Hussein, while at the same time a Palestinian kid throwing rocks at an Israeli soldier is considered a terrorist act. Violence will not be the harbinger of change so long as the violence in the Middle East is perceived as terrorism. If the absence of violence in resistance movements is what it will take to bring change and a better future for Palestinians, then non-violent movements should be fully supported, despite and in the face of Israeli aggression.

Perceptions of violence in Israel-Palestine has often been more favorable for the Israeli government. If the mode of violence matters then the ways in which people are killed matters. Suicide bombers (which is not unique to the Middle East) are often thought of to be worse than Israeli warplanes killing Palestinian civilians⁵⁷. Either the perception is that one form of violence is inflicted on people who essentially deserved to be killed and were already guilty of *something*, and therefore is justified (Israeli warplanes) and the other inflicted violence on those who did not deserve it and are innocent bystanders (suicide bombers) when victims of both sides are civilians.

What is and is not terrorism is left up to the countries with power. Terrorism is not always clear cut, as Israel has a policy of “roof-knocking.” During Operation Cast Lead in the

⁵⁶ "Madeleine Albright." - Wikiquote. https://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/Madeleine_Albright

⁵⁷ "Majority of Palestinians Killed by Israeli Airstrikes Were Civilians." High Civilian Death Toll in Gaza. February 13, 15. <http://america.aljazeera.com/articles/2015/2/13/majority-of-palestinians-killed-by-israeli-airstrikes-were-civilians.html>.

Gaza Strip, residents would receive a warning via telephone, followed by a missile strike just above the roof. Roof-knocking was designed to allow residents enough time to exit their homes in what Israel calls an attempt to “save lives.” Roof-knocking is psychological warfare combined with actual warfare, where “warnings are sometimes not followed by strikes or that sometimes a strike is not preceded by a warning.” It is an ineffectual and terrifying tactic with the U.N.

Human Rights Council stating roof-knocks "cannot be considered an effective warning given the confusion they often cause to building residents and the short time allowed to evacuate before the actual strike."⁵⁸ In response to the September 11th terrorist attacks, Mahmoud Darwish writes:

the great American values of freedom, democracy and human rights, have stopped functioning - - especially in the Palestinian context where the Israeli occupation remains free from answering to international law while the U.S. provides it with what it needs of rationalizations and justifications for practices which border on "state terrorism"... Security measures alone are not enough since terrorism carries within its folds a multiplicity of nationalities and recognizes no boundaries. The world cannot be divided into two societies, one for the rebels and the other for the officers of the law. But then, nothing, nothing justifies Terrorism.⁵⁹

The Israeli occupation cannot “border” on state terrorism without being terrorism. There is not a way to “border” on terrorism. Either it is terrorism or it isn't. Therefore if “nothing justifies terrorism” as Darwish states, then Israel's occupation is unjustifiable. This would mean Israel would have to surrender violence as a means of oppression against the Palestinians as Palestinians are told to surrender violence as a means of resistance to Israel's occupation. This is the case since if violence perpetrated by Palestinians is always terrorism, violence has to be taken out of the equation in order for resistance movements to gain any traction.

⁵⁸ Taylor, Adam. "Israel's Controversial 'roof Knocking' Tactic Appears in Iraq. And This Time, It's the U.S. Doing It." Washington Post. April 27, 2016. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2016/04/27/israels-controversial-roof-knocking-tactic-appears-in-iraq-and-this-time-its-the-u-s-doing-it/>

⁵⁹ Darwish, Mahmoud: *But then, nothing, nothing justifies Terrorism*. 2001. <http://listserv.linguistlist.org/pipermail/discours/2001-September/001212.html>

Gaining legitimacy as a resistance movement is a delicate process, which is why there needs to be a focus on Palestinian non-violent resistance movements when dealing with Israel. News media is content with violent images to summarize the Israel-Palestine conflict, whereas more of an effort can be easily shifted to the non-violent aspects of the resistance.

Palestinians with weapons in the West Bank and Gaza will never be able to compete with the Israel Defense Force. Hamas's financial support from Iran does not rival the billions of dollars in military aid the United States provides to Israel every year. The Qassam rockets are ineffective, used as more of a tool of nuisance against the Israeli government. With Qassam rockets' production costs low, it is also a tool of abundance, however these are not the weapons which will bring about any change. Violence has not been a successful tactic for Hamas or any other Palestinian organization, and not for a lack of effort. It is also why Hamas has changed its Charter, where the document is:

notably absent from any Hamas statement and is unavailable on most Arabic language webpages affiliated with Hamas. One exception is the web presentation of the Qassam Brigades (Hamas' military wing) which, in the summer of 2010, published an abridged version which rather tellingly only included the Charter's 'Ideological Starting-Points' and deleted the anti-Semitic slander of subsequent paragraphs.⁶⁰

In order for Palestinians to be successful in bringing about any modicum of change, non-violent resistance in conjunction with violent resistance has to end. The resistance to Israeli occupation and oppression cannot be concurrently violent and non-violent. The central focus should be continuing to non-violently fight for self-determination. In this case, violence has been ineffective and counterproductive. Lost in the violent images and narrative of Zionism, Palestinians "have been refugees since the establishment of the State of Israel as a Zionist state. The Palestinians, nevertheless, have insisted upon the maintenance of their status as a people."

⁶⁰ Bröning, Michael. *The Politics of Change in Palestine State-Building and Non-Violent Resistance*. New York. Pluto Press, 2011 [p. 15-16]

The General Assembly to the United Nations wrote in a resolution in 1969 that they are:

Gravely concerned that the denial of [Palestinians] rights has been aggravated by the reported acts of collective punishment, arbitrary detention, curfews, destruction of homes and property, deportation and other repressive acts.⁶¹

Decades later the words in the resolution is still the case. A unified, non-violent resistance to challenge the Israel government can be accomplished.

One of the ways to accomplish a viable non-violent resistance is through art. Palestinian art as resistance needs to be recognized and a supported form of resistance. In television news media, violent images are a lucrative venture, often times precedent by a warning of the explicit content. Palestinians as violent terrorists disrupting the Jewish peoples right to live is the preferred narrative of Israel's government. American news media is reluctant to show Palestinians as anything other than violent or without a voice:

In the U.S. media, Palestinians generally aren't allowed to speak for themselves or to articulate their historical narrative. Israelis, however, are permitted to speak, to explain the Israeli experience and even to explain about Palestinians. As a result, the Israeli story is known in the U.S. while Palestinians are dehumanized.⁶²

Non-violent resistance is not a new concept for Palestinians. It is a matter of recognition of an ongoing struggle for support in combating Israel's occupation by alternative means other than violence. Israel has the benefit of the media in the United States as well, as they never “report on what 99.5% of Palestinians have done every day of their lives for the last 38 years — nonviolently resist Israeli occupation.”⁶³ Palestinians aren't going to be able to exist as an invisible entity at the same time as being “violent terrorists.” Through a continuation of non-

⁶¹ W. T. Mallison, Jr. and S. V. Mallison. *The Juridical Characteristics of the Palestinian Resistance: An Appraisal in International Law*. University of California Press. *Journal of Palestine Studies*, Vol. 2, No. 2 (Winter, 1973), pp. 64-78

⁶² O'Connor, Patrick. "The Invisibility of Palestinian Nonviolent Resistance in the New York Times." *The Electronic Intifada*. October 23, 2005. <https://electronicintifada.net/content/invisibility-palestinian-nonviolent-resistance-new-york-times/5775>.

⁶³ *Ibid*.

violent resistance, Israel's violent reactions to peaceful Palestinians protests, civil disobedience and other forms of non-violent resistance will shed light on the oppressiveness of the Israeli government. Non-violent movements are not always met with non-violence in return. However, as Israel continues to react violently to Palestinians non-violent resistance, the innocent, impeccable veneer of the Israel government will begin to fade.

Hamas and Fatah are not the only options or path to peace for the Palestinians. If there is a movement to get behind, it is the art movement. Art production in Palestine expresses the aspirations and goals of people. Art provokes thought and provides an avenue to challenge without bloodshed. Palestinians cannot be doomed to be under the shadow of suicide bombers or those who continue to use violence. The production of Palestinian art as the foundations of the resistance to garner solidarity world wide. Whether or not people agree with the totality of the messages behind each and every art piece or exhibition, the inherent non-violent nature of the art as the resistance needs to be supported on an international scale. A major roadblock for people to support Palestinian resistance to Israel is how the word terrorism is defined, discussed and applied.

There is not a universal definition of *terrorism* with many scholars, government agencies and political thinkers describing and applying the term differently. The FBI says terrorism is “intended to intimidate or coerce a civilian population,” and “to influence the policy of a government by intimidation or coercion.”⁶⁴ A synthesis of terrorism definitions ascertained “terrorism is a politically motivated tactic involving the threat or use of force or violence in which the pursuit of publicity plays a significant role.”⁶⁵ Defining terrorism has been as much of

⁶⁴ "Definitions of Terrorism in the U.S. Code." FBI. 2013. <https://www.fbi.gov/about-us/investigate/terrorism/terrorism-definition>.

⁶⁵ Weinberg, Leonard; Pedahzur, Ami & Hirsch-Hoefler, Sivan (2004): “The Challenges of Conceptualizing Terrorism.” *Terrorism and Political Violence*. [p. 782]

a hassle as has been the 'war on terror.' Without a doubt, 9/11 and the 2015 Paris attacks fit all the descriptions of terrorism. Under the headline “Major Palestinian Terror Attacks”⁶⁶ the Israeli Defense Force lists the first *terrorist* attack for 2000 as “Palestinians riot on Jerusalem’s Temple Mount, hurling rocks at Jewish worshipers at the Western Wall and Israeli policemen.” The headline “*Rock-Throwing Terrorists Target Jerusalem Bus*”⁶⁷ shows up in news reports. Since Israel says throwing rocks is terrorism, how does Palestinian art counter and respond to this narrative?

Is Israel's classification of rock throwing being a terrorist activity correct? How can they compare the destruction of a hand-thrown projectile which lacks any explosive element, shrapnel, incendiaries, speed or accuracy, to that of an advanced Israeli military? It is impossible to look at the two and determine the destruction is in any way similar. Tanks are heavily armored, carry munitions with mounted crew-served weapons with the occupants having personal weapons as well. In contrast, rocks vary in size, the rate of speed determined by the strength and mechanics of the rock-thrower. No matter if Palestine's rock-throwers threw as fast as the average MLB pitcher, or the slowest pitcher in the MLB, the damage caused by hurled rocks manage to be considered an act of terror, according to the Israeli government.

There is an extreme disparity of violence, power and wealth between Israel and the West Bank and Gaza. Rocks may not be weapon of choice, rather weapon of convenience or weapon of the oppressed during the intifada. With this disparity, rocks as tools of resistance show up in numerous images. The images all share a common theme, dominance and spontaneous resistance. The Israeli tanks rolling through Palestinian refugee camps and villages are met with

⁶⁶ Røislien, Hanne Eggen & Jo Røislien. *The Logic of Palestinian Terrorist Target Choice?: Examining the Israel Defense Forces’ Official Statistics on Palestinian Terrorist Attacks 2000–2004*. Studies in Conflict & Terrorism. Volume 33, Issue 2, 2010. [Table 1, p. 138]

⁶⁷ Benari, Elad. "Rock-Throwing Terrorists Target Jerusalem Bus." Arutz Sheva. December 03, 2013. http://www.israelnationalnews.com/News/News.aspx/174731#.Vtbye_197IW.

spontaneous resistance, a rejection of the mere presence of the tank garners an instant negative reaction. The images are symbolic in the sense that Israel is represented as an armored juggernaut flexing its military might versus the unprotected kids in the streets, who are fully vulnerable to the whims of the tanks operators. It is an image of flesh and bone battling a metal force. In the film *Divine Intervention*, the rock is substituted for a tossed apricot pit which explodes an Israeli tank upon impact.⁶⁸

If publicity is an element of terrorism, and rock throwing is terrorism, the publicity comes from the photographs captured of the disparity of power which is on full display when a Palestinian kid throws rocks at Israeli tanks. Throwing rocks are not unwarranted acts of violence as these tanks are not there on a humanitarian mission providing goods and services. The absurdity of this is captured in the art piece *A Time to Cast Stones* by Rajie Cook, with stones taking the place of bullets in an ammo can. The exhibition is an “ironic commentary on unfair fighting,” with the “Israel Defense Force employ[ing] a cache of high-tech American-supplied F-16 fighter jets, Cobra helicopters and Caterpillar bulldozers,” while “Palestinians defend their homes with a meager arsenal of low-tech weaponry-- rocks.”⁶⁹

If throwing rocks is resistance to Israel's occupation, and resistance is terrorism, then art in the West Bank and Gaza is a form of terrorism. Palestinian artist Khaled Jarrar posted forty-one photographs of various Israeli checkpoints at two Israeli checkpoints in 2007 as an “anti-exhibit exhibition.” Khaled photographed the event, in which Palestinians and Israeli soldiers:

became spectators as well as subjects and creating a chain of images: photographic images of Palestinians and Israeli soldiers looking at photographs of Palestinians and Israeli soldiers.⁷⁰

⁶⁸ Hochberg, Gil Z. 2015. *Visual occupations: violence and visibility in a conflict zone*. Duke University Press [p. 70]

⁶⁹ Oweis, Faye. *Encyclopedia of Arab American Artists*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2008. [p. 85]

⁷⁰ Hochberg, Gil Z. 2015. *Visual occupations: violence and visibility in a conflict zone*. Duke University Press [p. 108]

The exhibit was intrusive to Israeli space where Khaled could “create a dialogue with the soldiers” and “affect their consciousness.” Khaled's exhibition was a momentary shift in power at Israeli checkpoints, where the power belongs to the soldiers:

the soldiers don't really see the Palestinians. They don't talk to them. They don't look them in the eyes.... [T]hey look with one eye on the target but they ignore the eye that sees a human being.⁷¹

The mere act of posting photographs at Israeli checkpoints involves “influencing a civilian population,” which, according to the FBI and certainly the Israeli government can be an act of terror. The Israeli soldiers and Palestinians viewing the photographs become both the audience and the spectator.

Khaled isn't the first nor the last artist to use art as an act of resistance. Many artists make use of the wall that separates Israel and Palestine. Israel classifies the wall as a “security fence,” denying any such notion that the wall was built to keep Palestinians out. The wall has become a canvas for both Israeli and Palestinian artists:

The Israeli side — located within the so-called “free world” — is often decorated by officialdom with idyllic landscapes designed to conceal its “concrete” reality. On the Palestinian side, the interior walls of the prison that is the occupied West Bank, resistance art is now flourishing.⁷²

The wall art operates “in a place where beauty shouldn’t be.” The wall is a visual manifestation of oppression which serves an ulterior function never intended. The wall is used as a forum to communicate, as Julie Peteet writes,

A standard tactic of the uprising was “days of confrontations” with the occupations authorities. Designated by the leadership, these were days when people were encouraged to take part in activities designed to engage soldiers in confrontations, such as stone-throwing or setting up barricades. They were intended to spark mass mobilization,

⁷¹ Ibid. [p. 109]

⁷² Deane, Raymond. "Art as Resistance: "Against the Wall" Reviewed." *The Electronic Intifada*. August 27, 2010. <https://electronicintifada.net/content/art-resistance-against-wall-reviewed/3595>.

drawing people out of their homes and everyday lives into the melee of resistance activities.⁷³

The graffiti is in Arabic, (which the IDF soldiers are unable to read) and they take extreme measures to paint over these messages where “jeep loads of soldiers round up five or six boys” while they “march them at gunpoint to the walls to blacken out graffiti and murals.”⁷⁴ The message may be gone, but the erasure is a new blank space to record another message. It is a cyclic battle of temporary art and graffiti versus censorship and control. The intent for the wall was to keep people out and away from the inside, denying access and freedom of movement. Israel provides the wall in which Palestinians use as a mode of resistance. During the first intifada a message was spray painted on the wall, “Prison is for relaxation, deportation policy is for tourism, throwing stones is exercise – UNL.”⁷⁵

With numerous definitions of terrorism, there is also a matter of if terrorism works. Terrorism is condemned, denounced and it is said that no matter what, 'terrorism should not be employed by anyone', that is unless the terrorists succeed and create a state. Israel is a beneficiary of terrorism with help from “two Jewish terrorist organizations, the “Irgun Zvai Le' umi (National Military Organization)” and the Stern Gang which “arose to challenge Britain's rule over Palestine.”⁷⁶ Israel denounces the very thing that helped them succeed. Although it has to be stated terrorism was not the only factor in establishing the state of Israel as Bruce Hoffman says:

The struggle for Jewish statehood employed almost every means possible: diplomacy, negotiation, lobbying, civil disobedience, propaganda, information operations, armed

⁷³ Peteet, Julie *The Writing on the Walls: The Graffiti of the Intifada* Cultural Anthropology, Vol. 11, No. 2 (May, 1996), [p. 143]

⁷⁴ Ibid. [p. 148]

⁷⁵ Ibid [p. 146]

⁷⁶ Hoffman, Bruce. 2015. *Anonymous soldiers: the struggle for Israel, 1917-1947*. New York. Random House. 2015 [p. xi]

resistance, and terrorist violence.⁷⁷

Terrorism certainly was not the *only* factor for Israel then, as terrorism is not the *only* factor now in Palestine. Swap out “Jewish statehood” above for 'Palestinian' and the quote above would also be accurate. However, this is not the narrative Israel needs to keep the Palestinians stagnant. Any actions Palestinians take are scrutinized, as former Israeli Prime Minister Ariel Sharon says that Israeli's “are facing an enemy whose culture is a culture of death,” and that, “You cannot confront a culture like this and tell them to lift a white flag just because you killed a hundred or even a thousand of their people. For them, this is a victory.” In effect, Israel can cry wolf about Palestinian 'terrorism' inflicted upon them without having to answer for their own history of terrorism because “Israel's own image of normality greatly depends on the production and circulation of Palestine as an image of violence, self destruction, victimization, and (a culture of) death.”⁷⁸ Controlling one's own image has become a battle all its own in Palestine.

While Palestinians:

depend on the circulation of images of armed civilians and victims as perhaps one of the only symbolic means of promoting a communal sense of empowerment, resistance, and collective mourning. As a society that cannot even pretend to generate a facade of normalcy, Palestinians often highlight images of armed conflict in part to make the conditions of living under military occupation visible to others.⁷⁹

Hamas and suicide bombings on Israeli citizens are not the reasons why there is little help for Palestinians. Long before the suicide bombings Palestinians never had the help they needed to confront or stand up against Israel. Palestinians operate and are compartmentalized in two separate and distinct realms, that of a terrorist and the other the invisible enemy, with movements between the two dictated by Israel. Israel decides the mode of violence, creates the space for

⁷⁷ Ibid [p. 6]

⁷⁸ Hochberg, Gil Z. 2015. *Visual occupations: violence and visibility in a conflict zone*. Duke University Press (2015) [p. 10]

⁷⁹ Ibid. [p. 10-11]

resistance and attempts to place Palestinians into a single space, where their existence is only tolerable if Palestinians do not do anything. When Palestinians do something, anything, Israel quickly puts it in the terrorism column of their database. The boosted terror attack numbers aimed at Israel makes it so that their responses to Palestinian actions are justifiable, with their terrorism numbers boosted by rocks thrown by kids make it seem like a new 9/11 happens almost everyday. Israel passed a bill effectively giving them free reign in determining what terrorism is. When Israel includes rock-throwing and graffiti as terrorism, the 'war on terrorism' shifts from fighting al-Qaeda and ISIS-type terrorist organizations to whatever Israel wants terrorism to be.

When Israel is able to control the image of Palestinians, they are able to control the narrative. However, Israel fails to completely conceal and remove Palestinian art, just as when the “Zionist Israeli Jewish enterprise failed both in removing the original inhabitants of the land and in concealing their traces.” The erasure of graffiti and art on the walls that separate Palestine from Israel is another attempt by Israel to completely remove Palestinians from visibility. Art as a means of resistance is often over-looked on the outside as a viable means of resistance. While within Israel-Palestine, art is one of the few things Israel is unable to successfully control. Since “Israel has not succeeded in generating a myth of a unified democratic collective origin,” Palestinians are able to intermittently disrupt Israeli life as a reminder of their existence. Palestinians are able to hold on to the production of art to remain visible to Israel, as a reminder that they are still there and deny the opportunity to let Israel succeed in “hiding the ongoing violence involved in the state's establishment.”⁸⁰ Resistance art provides the ability to express that the oppression, destruction and murder of Palestinian civilians does not go unnoticed, nor will it ever be acceptable.

⁸⁰ Hochberg, Gil Z. 2015. *Visual occupations: violence and visibility in a conflict zone*. Duke University Press [p. 38]

Children in the West Bank and the Gaza Strip's inclusion in producing resistance art correlates with their inclusion of being killed by the IDF. Israel's Operation Cast Lead in 2008 killed over 300 children⁸¹ and was the impetus to an art exhibition called "A Child's View from Gaza" organized by 'Let the Children Play & Heal'. The exhibition was to be held at the Oakland's Museum of Children's Art, with the Gazan children providing "images of Israeli planes dropping bombs on apartment houses," and "soldiers, tanks and ambulances in the streets."⁸² Facing pressure from pro-Israel groups headed by the Jewish Community Relations Council (JCRC), Oakland's Museum of Children's Art canceled the exhibition. Executive Director of Middle East Children's Alliance (MECA) Barbara Lubin spoke of the censorship:

We understand all too well the enormous pressure that the museum came under. But who wins? The museum doesn't win. MECA doesn't win. The people of the Bay Area don't win. Our basic constitutional freedom of speech loses. The children in Gaza lose... The only winners here are those who spend millions of dollars censoring any criticism of Israel and silencing the voices of children who live every day under military siege and occupation.⁸³

Barbara Lubin is correct about the millions of dollars spent on the censorship of Palestinian voices. Money is raised by pro-Israel groups, whom John J. Mearsheimer and Stephen M. Walt call these pro-Israel groups the "Israel Lobby" and describes them as a "loose coalition of individuals and organizations that actively work to shape U.S. Foreign policy in a pro-Israel direction."⁸⁴ The money is either collected and given to Israel (tax exempt) for the purpose of funding Israel's occupation of the West Bank and Gaza or used on the behalf of Israel in the

⁸¹ "Fatalities during Operation Cast Lead." B'Tselem. Accessed May 15, 2016. <http://www.btselem.org/statistics/fatalities/during-cast-lead/by-date-of-event>.

⁸² Pasquini, Elaine. 2011. "Gaza Kids' Art Show a Smashing Success Despite Museum's Attempt at Censorship." *Washington Report On Middle East Affairs* 30, no. 9: 42-43. *Military & Government Collection*, EBSCOhost (accessed May 18, 2016).

⁸³ "Media Advisory: Oakland Museum of Children's Art Shuts Down Palestinian Children's Exhibit." Home. Accessed May 18, 2016. <https://www.mecaforpeace.org/news/media-advisory-oakland-museum-childrens-art-shuts-down-palestinian-children's-exhibit>.

⁸⁴ Mearsheimer, John J. and Walt, Stephen. (2007). *The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux. [p. 112]

United States to shutdown a children's art exhibition.

A common theme emerges with the censorship of Palestinian art. The censorship is not always due to criticisms of Israel or drawings of Israeli tanks destroying homes in the Gaza strip. Reasons for the censorship of Palestinian art, in the case of Larissa Sansour, was due to her Nation Estate project merely being “too Pro-Palestinian.” The firm who censored Sansour's art denies the reasons, although the evidence suggests otherwise:

As a nominee, Sansour was awarded a bursary of €4,000 and given carte blanche to produce a portfolio of images for the final judging. In November 2011, three photos for Sansour's Nation Estate project were accepted, and she was congratulated by the prize administrators on her work and professionalism. Sansour's name was included on all the literature relating to the prize and on the website as an official nominee. Her name has since been removed, just as her project has been withdrawn from an upcoming issue of contemporary art magazine ArtReview introducing the nominated artists.⁸⁵

Being born in Jerusalem and creating art which reflects her background, Sansour has been punished for being too pro-Palestinian. Artists have to operate and be wary of crossing an invisible threshold set by an invisible network of people in power of supporting Palestine *too much*. This accusation would not make sense if it was “too pro-American” or “too pro-Israeli.” There is no such thing as being *too*-American. The United States leading up to and on the 4th of July is awash in American flags and American flag sequined merchandise. Sansour can only speculate for the exact reasons her art work was censored, saying:

What seems to have struck them is the content of this new work which is inspired by the Palestinian bid for official status at the United Nations. That appears to have been too controversial for Lacoste.⁸⁶

Reasons for censorship vary, with Israel claiming the reason for censorship is to prevent incitement, particularly during the First Intifada where:

⁸⁵ "Lacoste: No Room For Palestinian Artist." ArtLeaks. December 20, 2011.<https://art-leaks.org/2011/12/20/lacoste-no-room-for-palestinian-artist/>.

⁸⁶ Ibid.

Censors perceive any live performance in front of a public to be dangerous thanks to theatre's acknowledged capacity to incite audiences....Hamlet as a book, for example, is banned in the Occupied Territories.⁸⁷

Israel has an unclear definition of incitement, which is why certain colors have been banned such as the Palestinian flag, which become:

metonymic emblems of Palestinian identity, the existence of which is officially denied. Fathi Gha- bin, a Palestinian artist, was sentenced to six months in prison for exhibiting a painting whose prominent colors were red, black, green, and white. "First it is the colors, you have the colors of the PLO flag,' an Israeli official said in explaining Mr. Ghabin's conviction. 'This is considered inciting material because it insinuates the ongoing armed struggle.'"⁸⁸

Dr. Sa'ed Atshan, Professor of Peace and Conflict Studies at Swarthmore College has first hand account of censorship being imposed by the IDF. During the First Intifada the IDF destroyed his grandmother's painting of a watermelon because it shares the same colors with the Palestinian flag -- red, green and black. Dr. Atshan says his grandmother:

displayed it prominently in our living room. I remember when the soldiers stormed into the house, and they asked "What is this?" and they started stomping on it with their boots. My grandmother very kindly said to them with a smile, "What's wrong? It's just a watermelon," and then we all laughed. That moment was so empowering. At that moment we felt like we had something stronger than all of their guns, all of their weapons, all of their tanks. We had each other, we had our spirits. They could not take that away from us.⁸⁹

"Incitement" has been the default reasoning for Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu, where he says Palestinians teach their children to hate Israelis. Instead of seeing resistance movements and resiliency in Palestinians, Netanyahu calls it incitement. Netanyahu's use of the word is a "public relations tool,"⁹⁰ suggesting any Palestinian resistance is inherently villainous.

⁸⁷ Slyomovics, Susan. 1991. "'to Put One's Fingers in the Bleeding Wound': Palestinian Theatre Under Israeli Censorship". *TDR (1988-)* 35 (2). The MIT Press: 18–38 [p.27]

⁸⁸ Ibid. [p. 28]

⁸⁹ "Israel/Palestine Working Group." SoundCloud. May 11, 2016. <https://soundcloud.com/user-810169530/israelpalestine-working-group>.

⁹⁰ Miller, Elhanan. *The curious Israeli half-battle against 'Palestinian incitement'*. October 30, 2013. <http://www.timesofisrael.com/the-curious-israeli-half-battle-against-palestinian-incitement/>

It is a situation where Palestinians continuing to work their land is in and of itself an act of survival. Dr. Atshan expresses “in conflict zones... we often forget there is resistance and there is resilience...Existence is resistance.”⁹¹

What does pressure from the pro-Israel groups look like? What is at stake and what is held against a museum in Oakland, California? Censorship takes the form of creating a “\$6 million dollar initiative” called the Israel Action network, “devoted to combating the “delegitimization” of Israel by attacking grassroots activism expressing solidarity with Palestine.”⁹² The pressure is the fear of being called antisemitic, where:

journalists, editors and politicians are going to think twice about criticizing Israel if they know they are going to get thousands of angry calls in a matter of hours. The Jewish lobby is good at orchestrating pressure.⁹³

The pressure to censor stories of Palestinian solidarity turns into self censorship. It is an overwhelming flurry of the Israel lobby and those the Israel lobby have influenced. The Israel lobby has flipped the narrative, where the oppressors are the victims and the victims are the oppressors.

On the website "B'Tselem -The Israeli Information Center for Human Rights in the Occupied Territories" lists how each Palestinian child was killed and where there body was found. The non-visual statistical data of the Israeli Information Center un-offiically works in conjunction with the drawings and paintings produced by the Gazan children who survived and witnessed the 2008 assault. Only one form of representation is allowed-- the non-visual record.

The Palestinian produced account and visual representation of the IDF statistical data is

⁹¹ "Israel/Palestine Working Group." SoundCloud. May 11, 2016. <https://soundcloud.com/user-810169530/israelpalestine-working-group>.

⁹² Silver, Charlotte. Sept 3, 2015. *US public school program comes under Israel lobby pressure*. <https://electronic-intifada.net/content/us-public-school-program-comes-under-israel-lobby-pressure/14819> (accessed May 18th 2016)

⁹³ Mearsheimer, John J. and Walt, Stephen. (2007). *The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux. [p. 172]

censored.

If children's art is of concern to pro-Israel lobbies, this speaks volumes to the threat of knowledge the art carries. If some art is too pro-Palestinian, what are the risks involved in *not* censoring Palestinian art? The Israeli government, along with the coalition of lobbies in support of Israel in the United States, the fear of persuasion of the art without the aspect of violence is the thorn in Israel's side. The lack of violence is a terrifying prospect for the Israeli Lobby, as these messages of Palestinian solidarity exist in form of resistance a mass audience can support. When art deemed “too-pro Palestinian” is censored, the insecurities of Israel and its lobbies are revealed. It calls attention to Israel's fragility as a state. Since Israel is a declared and recognized state, why almost seventy years later a collection of children's drawings pose a threat? When everything is either terrorism or too pro-Palestinian, Israel's consternation becomes invalid.

Envisioning a landscape in which a one-state solution is reached between Israel, the West Bank and Gaza have been met with laws which criminalize “the vision documents.” These documents were written in 2006, outlining processes of an imagined future of the region. The laws passed by the Knesset prohibit “voices and activities challenging the Jewish monopoly of the state, thus, limiting the democratic space open for citizens to reflect upon the principles of their regime and reshape it.”⁹⁴ The criminality of imagining an alternate future where Palestinians and Israelis living together is a sign of a Israel's fragility as a state. The detractors to the one state solution can find solace that if Israel and Palestine were ever to be one state, the possibilities of segregation are high. In the United States, neighborhoods have been segregated by railroads, highways and other forms of impasses, culminating in racially divided

⁹⁴ Azouly, Ariella and Adi Ophir. *The One State Condition: Occupation and Democracy in Israel/Palestine*. 2013. Stanford University Press. [pg. 266]

communities.⁹⁵

The integration of Palestinians and Israeli's would not be an instantaneous event based solely on how the communities have been constructed. The make-up and construction of communities, neighborhoods, and villages in the region are determined by “walkability levels” and “pedestrian volume distribution of non-residential land use.”⁹⁶ The dissolution of Israel's separation walls would drastically change the geographical dynamics, because:

Street patterns have also a great impact on the social dimension of the urban environment. For example, in the empirical studies conducted in several American cities, Grannis found that racial similarity among neighborhoods, like metropolitan macro-level segregation, emerged primarily by means of spatial connections constructed through tertiary street networks rather than simple geographical distance. More specifically, racial similarity emerged between neighborhoods connected through internal pedestrian streets, a trend that was limited by the presence of nonpedestrian streets. Grannis called this kind of neighborhood a 't-community' so as to indicate the role of pedestrian-oriented tertiary streets in creating social communities and neighborhoods.⁹⁷

A one-state solution would be an enormous undertaking, even when taking only the physical landscape into consideration. Israeli only roads, separation walls and other “infrastructures of control” would have to be removed or altered. Israel's urban planning for building settlements would be flipped on its head, where its function currently is building into selective Palestinian land in the West Bank. Israel has a “rapid intensive urban settlement” problem where the development of settlements have become “fractured, fragmented and disconnected over time” which “has significant implications on the urban form but also on the spatial integration and functioning of cities.”⁹⁸

Israel and pro-Israel supporters will claim this will be the *destruction* of Israel as a Jewish

⁹⁵ Oltmans Ananat, Elizabeth . *The Wrong Side(s) of the Tracks: The Causal Effects of Racial Segregation on Urban Poverty and Inequality*. September 2008. Duke University

⁹⁶ Itzhak Omer, Orna Zafrir-Reuven. *The Development Of Street Patterns In Israeli Cities*. Journal of Urban and Regional Analysis. Volume 7, Issue 2, 2015. [pg 113-114]

⁹⁷ Ibid. [124]

⁹⁸ Ibid.

state, and this is correct. This will certainly not be easy for many Israeli's to handle, especially when the 1.3 million Palestinians living in Israel are called "Israeli Arabs" because "Israeli Jews have traditionally sought to avoid recognizing their Palestinian national identity."⁹⁹ The destruction is a dissolution of an outdated insistence of being a state of exclusion. This does not mean the destruction of Israel as a state. The Israeli population compared to the Palestinian population is even, with 6.3 million Israeli Jews and 6.3 million Palestinians in total. When population is taken into account, Israel is already in effect not a "Jewish only" state. The military occupation controlling the lives of millions of people maintains the facade.

The imagined future of Palestine continues despite the prohibitions with many artists and filmmakers creating observations and proposals. Zochrat, an Israeli NGO have proposed:

various forms of return and absorption of Palestinian refugees....architects active in the Palestinian town of Beit Sahour, plan various forms of spatial decolonization of several settlements, whose dismantling they envisage, in a way that would avoid destruction and return some of the land to its owners, but also make renewed use of the space for the benefit of the Palestinian public....Yael Bartana and the curator Galit Eilat have co-edited a "recipe book" containing essays, artworks, and architectural plans envisaging a postnational future. The artist-curator Joshua Simon has edited *Solution 196-213: United States of Palestine-Israel*, a book containing various proposals and formulas for a joint Israeli-Palestinian future.¹⁰⁰

Plans would have to take into account reliable Palestinian access to water and reparations for the bulldozed homes throughout the West Bank. However, a one-state solution does not necessarily mean a unified state. Israel can keep in place the walls, citing any number of reasons to leave them standing.

Why would Israel agree to change the status-quo when there is not any incentives to do so? Israel's policy of building settlements in the West Bank have been described as "killing

⁹⁹ Waxman, Dov. 2013. "Israel's other Palestinian problem: the Future Vision Documents and the demands of the Palestinian minority in Israel. *Israel Affairs*. 19, no. 1: 214. *MasterFILE Premier*, EBSCOhost (accessed May 20, 2016) [pg. 215]

¹⁰⁰ Azouly, Ariella and Adi Ophir. *The One State Condition: Occupation and Democracy in Israel/Palestine*. 2013. Stanford University Press. [pg. 266]

itself” because “Arabs vastly outnumber Jews.”¹⁰¹ The Israel-Palestine conflict is one of the “root causes of instability”¹⁰² in the Middle East. Israel has proved to be an unreliable ally to the United States as well, deliberately sinking the USS Liberty¹⁰³, sidestepping nuclear arms inspections¹⁰⁴ and continuing to build settlements despite United Nations Resolution 446.¹⁰⁵ “[T]he Israeli leaders have constructed a concept of absolute security, based on absolute domination, the very unattainability of which leads the country into endless wars.”¹⁰⁶

Concessions would have to be made on all sides, however, Israel wields the power to enact change. Palestinians can only exist and operate through and around Israeli policy. The only option for Palestinians currently is to resist. Israel would still receive billions from the United States, as Israel and the United States have “existential threats” to be wary of. Currently Israelis exist in a:

conflictive reality of life in which Jewish citizens find themselves and in view of their blooming imagination in other realms, the lack of discourse envisaging a different future manifests the ongoing oppression of civil imagination under the existing regime.¹⁰⁷

While the majority of proposals and envisages of Palestine are in the immediate future, Larissa Sansour explores the possibilities of a distant future in the 2015 science fiction film *In the Future They Ate From the Finest Porcelain*. The movie is set in the dystopian future of

¹⁰¹ "Israel Is Destroying Itself With Its Settlement Policy". Intelligence Squared. 15 January 2013. <http://www.intelligencesquared.com/events/israel-settlement-policy/>

¹⁰² Alterman, Eric. "Is Israel Committing Suicide?" *Moment* 35, no. 3 (May, 2010) <http://search.proquest.com/evergreen.idm.oclc.org/docview/304686214?accountid=11199>.

¹⁰³ Findley, Paul. "Washington's Fateful Cover-Up of Israel's Attack on the USS Liberty." *Washington Report On Middle East Affairs*. 24, no. 6 (August 2005): 16-19. *Military & Government Collection*, EBSCOhost.

¹⁰⁴ Mearsheimer, John J. and Walt, Stephen. *The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2007. [pg. 35]

¹⁰⁵ "Resolution 446: Territories Occupied by Israel." United Nations. <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/RESOLUTION/GEN/NR0/370/60/IMG/NR037060.pdf?OpenElement>

¹⁰⁶ Gresh, Alain. "Reflections on the Meaning of Palestine." *Journal of Palestine Studies*, Vol. 41, No. 1 (Autumn 2011), pp. 67-81. University of California Press on behalf of the Institute for Palestine Studies. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1525/jps.2011.xli.1.67>

¹⁰⁷ Azouly, Ariella and Adi Ophir. *The One State Condition: Occupation and Democracy in Israel/Palestine*. 2013. Stanford University Press.[pg. 267]

Palestine, with archaeologists in space suits which “hints to the mechanisms of both nation-building and the politics of cultural extinction.” The porcelain symbolizing:

the appropriation and erasure of Palestinian material history, which is oftentimes discarded or manipulated to trace modern Israel’s Biblical origins (as in, for example, Jerusalem’s Bible Lands Museum, where relics varying from pre-classical cultures through the Middle Ages are streamlined with the creation of the modern state as its rational justification and official history).¹⁰⁸

With Sansour’s film set in the distant future, the distinction of Palestine and Israel is put into perspective. On a long enough time line, if Israel and Palestine were to merge into one unified state, would the 68 years of Israeli state-hood and colonial occupation be detectable? Would the archaeologists uncover pieces of the separation wall and brush off the dirt to reveal the graffiti?

Léopold Lambert’s *Weaponized Architecture* is a project in which he visualizes and illustrates various modes and possibilities of Palestinian resistance. In what Lambert calls “Palestinian disobedience,” the series of images envisions how Palestinians can alter the land to their advantage, subverting the Israeli authorities. Lambert shows this through a series of 3D rendered images of a *Qasr* (castle or fortress). The images show a construction of an underground dwelling in which rain is to be collected and used for agricultural purposes. The underground construction is camouflaged by a tent system which is integral to maintain their existence. *Weaponized Architecture* is an:

examination of the inherent instrumentalization of architecture as a political weapon...

Weaponized Architecture is thus manifested as a Palestinian shelter, with an associated agricultural platform, which expresses its illegality through its architectural vocabulary. The shelter constitutes both an architectural design and a narrative whose uncertainty is integrated as a creative catalyst.¹⁰⁹

Lambert’s images, although part fantasy, is cognizant of Israel’s ability to detect and destroy

¹⁰⁸ Akkermans, Ari. *A Sci-fi Film Imagines a Dystopian Future for Palestine*. April 26, 2016. <http://hyperallergic.com/293728/a-sci-fi-film-imagines-a-dystopian-future-for-palestine/>

¹⁰⁹ Lambert, Leopold. *Weaponized Architecture: A Disobedient Palestinian Building (2010)*. <http://www.leopold-lambert.net/2014/12/08/a-disobedient-architecture-in-the-west-bank/>

Palestinian homes. Lambert invokes the censorship policies of the Israeli government by including a panel in which the IDF searches for and destroys the fictional Qasr, bulldozing it in defense from a “terrorist infrastructure.”¹¹⁰ The camouflaged existence of Palestinian art and architecture is the result of the “warchitecture”¹¹¹ of Israel, whereby Israel's sieges of Gaza is predicated upon the destruction of architecture. The underground existence of Lambert's images provide Palestinians a bleak option to evade Israeli destruction.

The proposals and envisages produced by Palestinian artists and writers are fantasy because Palestinian self-determination and sovereignty exist only as such. The destruction of Palestinian architecture is an attempt to erase Palestinians. Bulldozing Palestinian homes in order to build settlements self-fulfills Theodore Herzl's claim of Palestine as a “land without a people.” Palestinian artists will continue to conceptualize a future for themselves which is free of a military occupation and oppression.

The media's penchant for showcasing violence is a hindrance in shaping the perceptions of the region, legitimizing and justifying one groups use of violence while demonizing the other. Palestinian art has been the steadiest form of non-violent resistance since the Jewish National Fund's 'Visit Palestine' poster. Israel's censorship of Palestinian art proves how the threat of knowledge influences a regime. My paper has shown that the production of art as a mode of resistance is a viable form of resistance to engage Israel on non-violent grounds. The engagement of artists to call into question the occupation and oppression of the Israeli government can sway public opinion to shed a more positive light on the Palestinian struggle for self-determination.

¹¹⁰ Herscher, Andrew. "Warchitectural Theory." *Journal of Architectural Education* (1984-) 61, no. 3 (2008): 35-43. <http://www.jstor.org/evergreen.idm.oclc.org/stable/40480772>. [p. 42]

¹¹¹ Ibid.

Groups such as *Visualizing Palestine* are able to inform a wide audience of the injustices and illegal activities of a military occupier through non-violent means of resistance. Along with art exhibitions and installations, the films of Elia Suleiman and Larissa Sansour are able to inform, detail and examine Israel's colonial regime. Palestinian artists are at the forefront of the non-violent resistance movement. The inherent non-violence of art has been shown to successfully counter Israel's oppression and occupation as seen through paintings, films, art installations, maps, photography, and graffiti. Palestinian artists have laid the building blocks of communication. Decolonization and ending the occupation of the West Bank and Gaza can happen through art, which has been providing avenues of discourse in the case of Léopold Lambert's *Weaponized Architecture* and the 'vision documents.' News media recognizing Palestinian art as a non-violent resistance movement would go a long way in reshaping the conversation. The lexicon of the Israel-Palestine would be able to development, instead of wading in accusations of antisemitism News writers, artists and those in academia with a focus in the Israel-Palestine conflict would be able to have a real conversation without fear of reprisal. In an introduction to Joe Sacco's graphic novel *Palestine*, Edward Said expressed Palestinians are:

banished to the fringes...without much hope or organization, except for their sheer indomitability, their mostly unspoken will to go on, and their willingness to cling to their story, to retell it, and to resist designs to sweep them away altogether.¹¹²

¹¹² Sacco, Joe, Edward W. Said. *Palestine*. Seattle, WA: Fantagraphics Books, 2001.

Bibliography

- Anderson, Benedict R. O'G. *Imagined communities: reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. London: Verso, 1991.
- Ankori, Gannit. *Palestinian art*. London: Reaktion, 2006.
- Azouly, Ariella and Adi Ophir. *The One State Condition: Occupation and Democracy in Israel/Palestine*. Stanford University Press, 2013.
- Alterman, Eric. "Is Israel Committing Suicide?" *Moment* 35, no. 3 (May, 2010)
<http://search.proquest.com/evergreen.idm.oclc.org/docview/304686214?accountid=11199>.
- Bateman, Milford, and Rostami-Povey, Elaheh. *Iran's Influence: A Religious-Political State and Society in Its Region*. London, GBR: Zed Books, 2010. ProQuest ebrary. Web. 6 May 2016.
- Benari, Elad. "Rock-Throwing Terrorists Target Jerusalem Bus." *Arutz Sheva*. December 03, 2013. http://www.israelnationalnews.com/News/News.aspx/174731#.Vtbye_197IW.
- "Border Agency Ready to Expand Virtual Fence along Southern Border." *Nextgov*.
<http://www.nextgov.com/defense/2016/03/border-agency-ready-expand-virtual-fence-along-southern-border/126873/?oref=ng-relatedstories>
- Bröning, Michael. *The Politics of Change in Palestine State-Building and Non-Violent Resistance*. New York: Pluto Press, 2011.
- Chomsky, Noam, Ilan Pappé, and Frank Barat.. *On Palestine*. Haymarket Books, 2015.
- Clark, Jonathan. "Digging in to Destroy a Tunnel." *Nogales International*. June 3, 2014.
http://www.nogalesinternational.com/news/digging-in-to-destroy-a-tunnel/image_a94320d4-eb34-11e3-8d8d-0019bb2963f4.html
- Darby, Thameen. "Nakba- The Palestinian Catastrophe." Google. February 12, 2006.
https://productforums.google.com/forum/#!topic/gec-history-illustrated-moderated/_QaklbTcnQ
- Darwish, Mahmoud: *But then, nothing, nothing justifies Terrorism*. 2001.
<http://listserv.linguistlist.org/-pipermail/discours/2001-September/001212.html>
- Deane, Raymond. "Art as Resistance: "Against the Wall" Reviewed." *The Electronic Intifada*. August 27, 2010. <https://electronicintifada.net/content/art-resistance-against-wall-reviewed/3595>.

- "Definitions of Terrorism in the U.S. Code." FBI. 2013. <https://www.fbi.gov/about-us/investigate/terrorism/terrorism-definition>.
- "Fatalities during Operation Cast Lead." B'Tselem. Accessed May 15, 2016. <http://www.btselem.org/statistics/fatalities/during-cast-lead/by-date-of-event>.
- Gregory, Derek. *The colonial present: Afghanistan, Palestine, and Iraq*. Blackwell Pub, 2004.
- Gresh, Alain. "Reflections on the Meaning of Palestine." *Journal of Palestine Studies*, Vol. 41, No. 1 (Autumn 2011), pp. 67-81. University of California Press on behalf of the Institute for Palestine Studies. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1525/jps.2011.xli.1.67>
- Gordon, Neve. *Israel's Occupation*. 1st ed. University of California Press, 2008.
- Hamdan, Sadiqua. "Social Justice Pioneers through Technology: An Interview with Ramzi Jaber - Current Affairs." *Current Affairs*. January 6, 13. <http://www.kalimatmagazine.com/currentaffairs/13705458>.
- Herscher, Andrew. "Warchitectural Theory." *Journal of Architectural Education (1984-)* 61, no. 3 (2008): 35-43.
- Hochberg, Gil Z. *Visual occupations: violence and visibility in a conflict zone*. Duke University Press, 2015.
- Hoffman, Bruce. 2015. *Anonymous soldiers: the struggle for Israel, 1917-1947*. New York. Random House. 2015
- Hunt, Tristram. 2013. "Israel, Palestine and the mapping of Power." *The Guardian*. February 04, 2013 <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2013/feb/04/israel-palestine-power-maps-ptolemy>
- "Israel Is Destroying Itself With Its Settlement Policy". *Intelligence Squared*. 15 January 2013. <http://www.intelligencesquared.com/events/israel-settlement-policy/>
- "Israel/Palestine Working Group." SoundCloud. May 11, 2016. <https://soundcloud.com/user-810169530/israelpalestine-working-group>.
- Itzhak Omer, Orna Zafrir-Reuven. *The Development Of Street Patterns In Israeli Cities*. *Journal of Urban and Regional Analysis*. Volume 7, Issue 2, 2015.
- "Lacoste: No Room For Palestinian Artist." *ArtLeaks*. December 20, 2011. <https://art-leaks.org/2011/12/20/lacoste-no-room-for-palestinian-artist/>.
- Lickteig, Jennifer. *Terrorist Organizations and the Use of Non-violent Tactics*. *Northwestern Journal of International Affairs*. Fall 2009. Vol. X, Issue I.

"Majority of Palestinians Killed by Israeli Airstrikes Were Civilians." High Civilian Death Toll in Gaza. February 13, 15. <http://america.aljazeera.com/articles/2015/2/13/majority-of-palestinians-killed-by-israeli-airstrikes-were-civilians.html>.

Manauagh, Geoff. *A Burglar's Guide to The City*. 1st ed. New York. Farrar, Straus & Giroux, 2016.

Mearsheimer, John J. and Walt, Stephen. *The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2007.

"Media Advisory: Oakland Museum of Children's Art Shuts Down Palestinian Children's Exhibit." Home. Accessed May 18, 2016. <https://www.mecaforpeace.org/news/media-advisory-oakland-museum-childrens-art-shuts-down-palestinian-children's-exhibit>.

Miltenburg, Anne. "Fighting with Visuals for Social Justice - What Design Can Do." What Design Can Do. May 26, 2014. <http://www.whatdesigncando.com/blog/2014/05/26/fighting-with-visuals-for-social-justice/>.

Nicolas Pelham. 2012. *Gaza's Tunnel Phenomenon: The Unintended Dynamics of Israel's Siege*. Journal Of Palestinian Studies. Vol 41.

O'Connor, Patrick. "The Invisibility of Palestinian Nonviolent Resistance in the New York Times." The Electronic Intifada. October 23, 2005. <https://electronicintifada.net/content/invisibility-palestinian-nonviolent-resistance-new-york-times/5775>.

Oltmans Ananat, Elizabeth . *The Wrong Side(s) of the Tracks: The Causal Effects of Racial Segregation on Urban Poverty and Inequality*. Duke University, 2008.

Oweis, Faye. *Encyclopedia of Arab American Artists*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2008

"The Palestine Poster Project Archives." Blessed Land of Israel Awaits Redemption. <http://www.palestineposterproject.org/poster/blessed-land-of-israel-awaits-redemption>.

— And We Will set Down Roots Here. <http://www.palestineposterproject.org/poster/and-we-will-set-down-roots-here>

— Here We Shall Stay. <http://www.palestineposterproject.org/poster/here-we-shall-stay>

Pasquini, Elaine. 2011. "Gaza Kids' Art Show a Smashing Success Despite Museum's Attempt at Censorship." *Washington Report On Middle East Affairs* 30, no. 9: 42-43. *Military & Government Collection*, EBSCOhost (accessed May 18, 2016).

Peteet, Julie *The Writing on the Walls: The Graffiti of the Intifada Cultural Anthropology*, Vol. 11, No. 2 (May, 1996)

- Quiquívix, Linda. 2014. "Art of War, Art of Resistance: Palestinian Counter-Cartography on Google Earth." *Annals Of The Association Of American Geographers*. 104, no. 3: 444-459.
- Røislien, Hanne Eggen & Jo Røislien. *The Logic of Palestinian Terrorist Target Choice?: Examining the Israel Defense Forces' Official Statistics on Palestinian Terrorist Attacks 2000–2004*. Studies in Conflict & Terrorism. Volume 33, Issue 2, 2010.
- Sacco, Joe, Edward W. Said. *Palestine*. Seattle, WA: Fantagraphics Books, 2001.
- Said, Edward W. *The Question of Palestine*. New York: Vintage, 1992.
- *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1978.
- The Politics of Dispossession; The Struggle for Palestinian Self-Determination, 1969-1994.
- Slyomovics, Susan. 1991. "'to Put One's Fingers in the Bleeding Wound': Palestinian Theatre Under Israeli Censorship". *TDR (1988-)* 35 (2). The MIT Press: 18–38
- Schwartz, Yardena. "Israel Is Building a Secret Tunnel-Destroying Weapon." *Foreign Policy*. March 10, 16. <http://foreignpolicy.com/2016/03/10/israel-is-building-a-secret-tunnel-destroying-weapon-hamas-us-gaza/>
- Sherwood, Harriet. "Israeli and Palestinian Textbooks Omit Borders." *The Guardian*. February 04, 2013 <http://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/feb/04/israeli-palestinian-textbooks-borders>
- Taylor, Adam. "Israel's Controversial 'Roof Knocking' Tactic Appears in Iraq. And This Time, It's the U.S. Doing It." *Washington Post*. April 27, 2016. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2016/04/27/israels-controversial-roof-knocking-tactic-appears-in-iraq-and-this-time-its-the-u-s-doing-it/>
- Walsh, Daniel J. 2011. *The Palestine Poster Project Archives: Origins, Evolution, And Potential*. Georgetown University.
- Waxman, Dov.. *"Israel's other Palestinian problem: the Future Vision Documents and the demands of the Palestinian minority in Israel. Israel Affairs*. 19, no. 1: 214. *MasterFILE Premier, EBSCOhost*, 2013.
- W. T. Mallison, Jr. and S. V. Mallison. *The Juridical Characteristics of the Palestinian Resistance: An Appraisal in International Law*. University of California Press. *Journal of Palestine Studies*, Vol. 2, No. 2 (Winter, 1973), pp. 64-78
- Weinberg, Leonard; Pedahzur, Ami & Hirsch-Hoefler, Sivan (2004): "The Challenges of Conceptualizing Terrorism." *Terrorism and Political Violence*.